

MINUTES

of the Local Planning Panel

held in

Council Chambers,

Wingecarribee Shire Council Civic Centre,

68 Elizabeth Street, Moss Vale

on

Wednesday 29 & Thursday 30 May 2024

The meeting commenced at 10.40am on Wednesday 29 May 2024

Table Of Contents

_

1 OPENING OF THE MEETING	.3
2 ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF COUNTRY	.3
3 APOLOGIES	.3
4 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST	.3
5 PLANNING PROPOSALS	.6
5.1 Results Of Independent Peer Review Of Draft Wingecarribee Community	
Heritage Study 2021-23	.6
6 DEVELOPMENT APPLICATIONS	.7
7 MEETING CLOSURE	.7

MINUTES OF THE LOCAL PLANNING PANEL MEETING OF WINGECARRIBEE SHIRE COUNCIL HELD IN COUNCIIL CHAMBERS, CIVIC CENTRE, ELIZABETH STREET, MOSS VALE ON WEDNESDAY 29 MAY 2024 COMMENCING AT 10:40 AM

Present:	Chairperson	Julie Walsh
	Council Representative – Alternate	Stephen Leathley
	Expert	Linda Kelly
	Community Representative	Richard Colley
	Community Representative	Anthony Geoffrey Neill
	Executive Manager Strategic Outcomes	Deniz Kilic
	Senior Strategic Planner	Sarah Farnese
	Executive Assistant Director Communities and Place	Leesa Stratford
	ICT Operations	Jon Campbell

1 OPENING OF THE MEETING

The Chairperson opened the meeting and welcomed members of the public and the press.

2 ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF COUNTRY

The Chairperson acknowledged country:

"Wingecarribee Shire Council acknowledge the Gundungurra and Tharawal people as the traditional custodians of this land we now call the Wingecarribee Shire. I pay my respect to Elders both past, present and emerging. I would also like to extend that respect to all Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders present here today."

3 APOLOGIES

There were no apologies for the meeting

4 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The following declarations of interest were declared at the meeeting

Julie Walsh, Linda Kelly and Stephen Leathley declared a non-pecuniary interest in item 5.1- Results of Independent Peer Review of Wingecarribee Community Heritage Study 2021-2023 for the following reasons:

- 1. They are expert members/Chairs on the Wingecarribee Local Planning Panel on which Dennis McManus sits as a community member. Mr McManus was a member of the Study Team involved in the preparation of the Community Heritage Study to be considered at this meeting. They all have no professional or personal relationship with MrMcManus and have only sat on a handful of meetings with him over the past 3 years. This is considered to be a non-significant interest and they intend to participate in the determination of the item.
- 2. They are expert members on the Wingecarribeee Local Planning Panel on which Robert Staas was formerly a community member. Mr Staas carried out the Peer Review of the Community Heritage Study which is to be considered at this meeting. They have no personal or professional relationship with Mr Staas and have only sat on a handful of meetings with him over the last 3 years. This is considered to be an interest of nonsignificance and they intend to participate in the determination of the item.

<u>Anthony Neill and Richard Colley</u> declared a non-pecuniary interest in item 5.1- Results of Independent Peer Review of Wingecarribee Community Heritage Study 2021-2023 for the following reasons :

- 1. They are Community representative members on the Wingecarribee Local Planning Panel on which Dennis McManus sits as a community member. Denis McManus was a member of the Study Team involved in the preparation of the Community Heritage Study to be considered at this meeting. They both have no professional or personal relationship with Denis McManus and have not sat on any meetings with him over the past 3 years. It is considered the interest is non-significant and both intend to participate in the determination of the item.
- 2. They are Community representatives on the Wingecarribeee Local Planning Panel on which Robert Staas was formerly a community member. Mr Staas carried out the Peer Review of the Community Heritage Study which is to be considered at this meeting. They have no personal or professional relationship with Mr Staas and have not sat on any meetings with him over the last 3 years. In those circumstances it is considered the interest is nonsignificant and both intend to participate in the determination of the item.

PUBLIC ADDRESS:

The following people addressed the Local Planning Panel in relation to items listed in the Draft Community Heritage Study 2021-2023.

Name	Study Item No.	Address of property	For/Against Peer Review Recommendation
Mr Brent Morrison	284	Spring Hill, 159 Railway Avenue,	Against
(representing owner)		Bundanoon	
Ms Patricia Arbib	277	71 Penrose Road, Bundanoon	Against
Dharmit Goradi	260	38-40 Church Street, Bundanoon	Against
(representing owner)			
Mr Michael Brearley	274	St Brigid's Church, 112-116 Hill Street,	Against
(representing St Paul's		Bundanoon	
Catholic Parish)			
Mrs Dawn Jonas	General	Exeter Items & Village Conservation Area	For
(representing Exeter			
Village Association)			
Mrs Ann Elbourne	576	7360 Illawarra Highway Sutton Forest	Against
Mr Paul Rappoport	361 &	Ulster Park, 1059 Nowra Road & Former	Neutral
(representing owner)	362	Church, 1131 Nowra Road, Fitzroy Falls	
Mr Robert Wilcher	334	Pheasant Hill, 1970 Kangaloon Road, East	For
		Kangaloon	
Mr Ian Pilgrim	486	38 Chapman Street, Moss Vale	For
Mr Oliver Kirkland	497	2 Narellan Road, Moss Vale	For
Mrs Dani Le Guay	508	10 Throsby Street Moss Vale	Against
Mr Barry Anstee	General		Against
Ms Lynne Gullifa	134	7 Jasmine Street, Bowral	For
Mr Richard Howell	28	2 Alfreda Street, Bowral	Against
Mr Stephen Partington	166	120 Merrigang Street, Bowral	Against
Mr Colin Anlezark	434	2 Pioneer Street, Mittagong	Against
(representing owner)			
Mr Tim Doyle	432	Redlands, 174-178 Oxley Drive,	Neutral
		Mittagong	
Ms Annabelle	225	17 St Jude Street, Bowral	Against
Wentworth			
Ms Caroline Fagan	493	7009 Illawarra Highway, Moss Vale	Against
Clive West	General		For

5 PLANNING PROPOSALS

5.1 Results of Independent Peer Review of Draft Wingecarribee Community Heritage Study 2021-23

Report Author:Senior Strategic PlannerAuthoriser:Deniz Kilic

OFFICER'S RECOMMENDATION

THAT the *Wingecarribee Community Heritage Study 2021-2023 Independent Peer Review 2024* as attached to this report be endorsed for public exhibition for a minimum of 28 days commencing on or before 1 June 2024 and concluding on 30 June 2024 via the Participate Wingecarribee platform.

THAT a report on the results of the public exhibition of the *Wingecarribee Community Heritage Study 2021-2023 Independent Peer Review 2024* and a draft Planning Proposal to affect the final recommendations be considered by the Local Planning Panel at the conclusion of public exhibition.

PANEL'S ADVICE

- 1. The Panel support that the Wingecarribee Community Heritage Study 2021-2023 Independent Peer Review 2024 as attached to these minutes be endorsed for public exhibition for a minimum of 28 days commencing on or before 1 June 2024 and concluding on 30 June 2024 via the Participate Wingecarribee platform.
- 2. The Panel supports a report on the results of the public exhibition of the Wingecarribee Community Heritage Study 2021-2023 Independent Peer Review 2024 and a draft Planning Proposal to implement the final recommendations be considered by the Local Planning Panel at the conclusion of public exhibition.
- 3. The Panel notes that the published Peer Review by Robert Staas (ATTACHMENT 1 to the Agenda paper) did not include commentary in relation to a number of submissions received on proposed heritage items. An Addendum Peer Review report by Robert Staas has now been published via the Participate Wingecarribee platform and is an ATTACHMENT to these minutes.
- 4. The Panel notes that the Peer Review by Robert Staas followed the same process whether the review was dealt with in the main report or the addendum.
- 5. The Panel notes a number of submissions were critical of the process followed in the preparation of the Wingecarribee Community Heritage Study. Robert Staas was satisfied that the process followed was sound and the Panel endorses this.

- 6. The Panel notes the comments of Robert Staas that decisions regarding heritage listing inevitably involve an element of subjectivity and it is not an empirical process. The Peer Review aims to provide an expert assessment.
- 7. Robert Staas inspected all properties from the public domain and where it was not possible to obtain a full viewing from the public domain, familiarised himself by other means including the material in the Community Heritage Study, Google Street View, Nearmap and other readily available sources.
- 8. Individual Panel members carried out physical site inspections from the public domain in respect to some properties proposed for heritage listing. The Panel members also considered the material in the study, other material such as Google Street View and Nearmap. The Panel also considered all submissions lodged with Council during the exhibition of the Community Heritage Study and additional information provided by some speakers at the meeting on 29 May 2024.
- 9. The Panel notes that as part of the exhibition process following this meeting affected property owners (including those properties identified as not warranting heritage listing in the Wingecarribee Community Heritage Study but recommended for listing by Robert Staas in the peer review) will have an opportunity to make a written submission.
- 10. The Panel did not consider it appropriate at this stage to alter any of the recommendations in the Peer Review or Peer Review addendum. However, the Panel may when it considers the matter on 31 July 2024, make recommendations in that regard.
- 11. The Panel recommends that Robert Staas be engaged to;
 - a. Review the submissions received and considered at the LPP meeting on 29 May 2024
 - b. Review any further submissions received as a result of the exhibition of the Wingecarribee Community Heritage Study Peer Review and Peer Review Addendum
 - c. Review the final statement of significance to be included in the report to be considered by the LPP on 31 July 2024

6 MEETING CLOSURE

29 May 2024 - The public address concluded at 12.30pm and the meeting was suspended to allow the Panel to discuss all relevant information.

30 May 2024 – The meeting resumed at 11:45pm

Being no further business, the meeting closed at 11:48pm

ATTACHMENT -- Addendum Peer Review